

FILED
DEBBIE CAUSSEAU

AUG 18 1999

CLERK, SUPREME COURT
By 

IN THE SUPREME COURT OF FLORIDA

ROBERT L. STURGIS,
Petitioner,

ORIGINAL

v.

CASE NO. 96,210

STATE OF FLORIDA,
Respondent.

ON DISCRETIONARY REVIEW FROM
THE FIFTH DISTRICT COURT OF APPEAL

JURISDICTIONAL BRIEF OF RESPONDENT

ROBERT A. BUTTERWORTH
ATTORNEY GENERAL

BELLE B. SCHUMANN
ASSISTANT ATTORNEY GENERAL
FLORIDA BAR #397024

KRISTEN L. DAVENPORT
ASSISTANT ATTORNEY GENERAL
Fla. Bar #909130
444 Seabreeze Blvd.
Fifth Floor
Daytona Beach, FL 32118
(904) 238-4990

COUNSEL FOR RESPONDENT

TABLE OF CONTENTS

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES ii

CERTIFICATE OF FONT AND TYPE SIZE 1

STATEMENT OF FACTS 2

SUMMARY OF ARGUMENT 3

ARGUMENT:

THIS COURT SHOULD DECLINE TO ACCEPT
JURISDICTION OF THIS CASE UNLESS IT
ACCEPTS JURISDICTION IN MCKNIGHT OR
SPEED. 4

CONCLUSION 6

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE 7

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

CASES:

Harrison v. Hyster Co.,
515 So. 2d 1279 (Fla. 1987) 4

Jollie v. State,
405 So. 2d 418 (Fla. 1981) 4

McKnight v State,
727 So. 2d 314 (Fla. 3d DCA 1999) 2,4

Speed v State,
732 So. 2d 17 (Fla. 5th DCA 1999) 2,4

Sturgis v. State,
733 So. 2d 1157 (Fla. 5th DCA 1999) 2

OTHER:

Art. V, § (3)(b)(3), Fla. Const. 4

CERTIFICATE OF FONT AND TYPE SIZE

The undersigned counsel certifies that this brief was typed using 12 point Courier New, a font that is not proportionately spaced.

STATEMENT OF FACTS

Sturgis' conviction and sentence were affirmed without opinion by the Fifth District Court of Appeal. Sturgis v. State, 733 So. 2d 1157 (Fla. 5th DCA 1999). In so holding, the district court found this case to be controlled by the recent decision of its sister court in McKnight v State, 727 So. 2d 314 (Fla. 3d DCA 1999), as well as its own prior opinion in Speed v State, 732 So. 2d 17 (Fla. 5th DCA 1999).

SUMMARY OF ARGUMENT

In deciding this case, the district court relied on recent opinions which have petitions for review presently pending before this Court. Should this Court grant review in those cases, the Court would also have jurisdiction to review the instant case.

As a practical matter, however, it may be more prudent to hold this petition for review in abeyance until this same issue is resolved in other pending cases.

ARGUMENT

THIS COURT SHOULD DECLINE TO ACCEPT
JURISDICTION OF THIS CASE UNLESS IT
ACCEPTS JURISDICTION IN MCKNIGHT OR
SPEED.

This Court has jurisdiction under article V, section (3) (b) (3) of the Florida Constitution where a decision of a district court "expressly and directly conflicts" with a decision of this Court or another district court. Where the district court's decision is a per curiam opinion which cites as controlling law a decision that is either pending review in or has been reversed by this Court, this Court has the discretion to accept jurisdiction. Jollie v. State, 405 So. 2d 418, 420 (Fla. 1981).

Here, the district court found this case to be controlled by the recent decision of its sister court in McKnight v. State, 727 So. 2d 314 (Fla. 3d DCA 1999), as well as its own prior opinion in Speed v State, 732 So. 2d 17 (Fla. 5th DCA 1999).. A petition for review of McKnight is presently pending before this Court (case # 95,154). A petition for review of Speed is presently pending before this Court as well (case # 95,706). Should this Court grant review in McKnight or Speed, jurisdiction would be appropriate in this case as well.

However, if this Court declines to accept jurisdiction in McKnight and Speed, then it must decline jurisdiction here also, as the district court's limited per curiam affirmed opinion does not

facially conflict with any other case.. See Harrison v. Hyster Co., 515 So. 2d 1279 (Fla. 1987).

Additionally, the State notes that this same issue -- the constitutionality of the Prison Releasee Reoffender Act -- is presently pending review in numerous other cases in this Court. See, e.g., State v. Cotton, case # 94,996. Accordingly, the State submits that the interests of judicial economy, as well as fairness to this defendant, can best be served by holding this petition for review in abeyance pending resolution of this issue in the other cases. Numerous cases involving this issue will be ripe for review by this Court in the near future, and little purpose would be served by full briefing in all of them.

CONCLUSION

Based on the arguments and authorities presented herein, respondent respectfully requests this honorable Court decline to accept jurisdiction of this case unless it accepts jurisdiction in McKnight or Speed.

Respectfully submitted,

ROBERT A. BUTTERWORTH
ATTORNEY GENERAL



BELLE B. SCHUMANN
ASSISTANT ATTORNEY GENERAL
Fla. Bar #397024



KRISTEN L. DAVENPORT
ASSISTANT ATTORNEY GENERAL
Fla. Bar #909130
444 Seabreeze Boulevard
Fifth Floor
Daytona Beach, FL 32118
(904) 238-4990

COUNSEL FOR RESPONDENT

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I HEREBY CERTIFY that a true and correct copy of the above Jurisdictional Brief has been furnished by hand delivery to M.A. Lucas, Assistant Public Defender, 112 Orange Avenue, Suite A, Daytona Beach, Florida 32114, this 16th day of August, 1999.



Kristen L. Davenport
Assistant Attorney General

IN THE SUPREME COURT OF FLORIDA

ROBERT L. STURGIS,
Petitioner,

v.

CASE NO. 96,210

STATE OF FLORIDA,
Respondent.

ON DISCRETIONARY REVIEW FROM
THE FIFTH DISTRICT COURT OF APPEAL

RESPONDENT'S APPENDIX

ROBERT A. BUTTERWORTH
ATTORNEY GENERAL

BELLE B. SCHUMANN
ASSISTANT ATTORNEY GENERAL
FLORIDA BAR #397024

KRISTEN L. DAVENPORT
ASSISTANT ATTORNEY GENERAL
Fla. Bar #909130
444 Seabreeze Blvd.
Fifth Floor
Daytona Beach, FL 32118
(904) 238-4990

COUNSEL FOR RESPONDENT

98-430 ML

IN THE DISTRICT COURT OF APPEAL OF THE STATE OF FLORIDA
FIFTH DISTRICT
JANUARY TERM 1999

ROBERT STURGIS,

Appellant,

NOT FINAL UNTIL THE TIME EXPIRES
TO FILE REHEARING MOTION, AND,
IF FILED, DISPOSED OF.

v.

Case No. 98-1291

STATE OF FLORIDA,

Appellee.

Opinion Filed June 25, 1999

RECEIVED

Appeal from the Circuit Court
for Volusia County,
S. James Foxman, Judge.

JUN 25 1999

James B. Gibson, Public Defender, and
M. A. Lucas, Assistant Public Defender,
Daytona Beach, for Appellant.

PUBLIC DEFENDER'S OFFICE
7th CIR. APP. DIV.

Robert A. Butterworth, Attorney General,
Tallahassee, and Kristen L. Davenport,
Assistant Attorney General,
Daytona Beach, for Appellee.

PER CURIAM.

AFFIRMED. See McKnight v. State, 727 So. 2d 314 (Fla. 3d DCA 1999); see also
Speed v. State, 24 Fla. L. Weekly D1017 (Fla. 5th DCA April 23, 1999); Woods v. State,
24 Fla. L. Weekly D831 (Fla. 1st DCA March 26, 1999).

SHARP, W., THOMPSON and ANTOON, JJ., concur.